

# Conditional citizenship: sanctions, support and social justice?

**Professor Peter Dwyer, College of Health and Social Care, University of Salford**

**Presentation to 'Citizenship and society: old and new ideas for challenging times'  
CESSS - Centro de Estudos de Serviço Social e Sociologia, Lisbon 6<sup>th</sup> - 7<sup>th</sup> June 2013**

**Email: [p.j.dwyer@salford.ac.uk](mailto:p.j.dwyer@salford.ac.uk) (to June 30<sup>th</sup>)**

**Email: [peter.dwyer@york.ac.uk](mailto:peter.dwyer@york.ac.uk) (from July 1<sup>st</sup>)**

# Introduction

- **Citizenship and social justice**

Contested concepts subject to debate and change

- **Towards conditional entitlement/citizenship**

The intensification and extension of conditionality

- **Sanctions, support and behaviour change: understanding the role and impact of welfare conditionality**

A five year ESRC (UK) funded study

- **Conclusion: constrained citizenship**

# Social justice and citizenship: competing visions

## ➤ Social justice

The justice of the market (Nozick, 1974,1995)

Justice beyond the market (Rawls, 1971)

Capabilities and justice (Sen,1992, 2010)

## ➤ Citizenship

### Liberalism

Citizenship as a status, rights and entitlements passively enjoyed

### Civic Republicanism/Communitarianism

Citizenship as an office, a responsibility, a burden proudly assumed (Walzer, 1989)

# Conditional entitlement/citizenship

## ➤ **An ongoing shift from welfare rights to conditional entitlement**

Social Liberal/Social Democratic PWWS: access to extensive unconditional (?) package of welfare rights a substantive part of citizenship status

Emergence of a new conditionality consensus: social citizenship is being reconfigured influenced by New Right and New Communitarian critics

## ➤ **Aspects of conditionality**

Principle of Conditionality (Deacon, 1994)

Realigning the relationship between entitlement/support and conduct/behaviour (Handler, 2004)

Use of sanctions and support ('sticks and carrots') to change behaviour

'Amorphous' – 'concrete' conditionality (Paz-Fuchs, 2008)

Social exclusion/reducing the welfare rights of poor people (Dwyer, 1998).

# The extension and intensification of conditionality: the UK example

## ➤ **New Labour (1997-2010)**

**Social security:** various 'New Deals' (from 1997), Welfare Reform and Pensions Act (1999), Welfare Reform Acts (2007, 2009), Jobcentre Plus (2002), Freud Report (2007), Employment and Support Allowance (2008)

**Management of anti social behaviour:** The Crime and Disorder Act (1998) Anti-Social Behaviour Act (2003), Criminal Justice Act (2003), Action Plan on Social Exclusion (2006), Respect Action Plan (RTF, 2006)

**Education and healthcare:** Sure Start Maternity Grant (2001), Welfare Food Scheme (2002), The Skills for Life Scheme (2001)

## ➤ **The Conservative/Liberal Coalition (2010 -?)**

**Enthusiastic endorsement of ESA:** use of WCA to reclassify many disabled people as fit for work

**Mandatory Work Activity (May 2011):** for JSA claimants with poor work records/ethnic  
**The Work Programme (June 2011)**

**The Welfare Reform Act (2012):** Introduction of Universal Credit, intensified, personalised and extended conditionality applied to in work benefit recipients for the first time

## Sanctions, support and behaviour change: understanding the role and impact of welfare conditionality

### ➤ **Five year project 2013-2018**

Six universities in England and Scotland

### ➤ **Explore conditionality across a range of policy domains**

Recipients of social security benefits (unemployed people, lone mothers, disabled people), homeless people, social tenants, individuals/families subject to antisocial behaviour orders/family intervention projects, offenders and migrants.

Funded by the ESRC under grant ref: ES/K002163/1

# Sanctions, support and behaviour change: understanding the role and impact of welfare conditionality

## ➤ **Twin aims**

To consider the ethics and efficacy of welfare conditionality

## ➤ **Methods**

Initial mapping of theoretical and normative frameworks, literature review, secondary data analysis, consultation workshops, expert panel seminars undertake

### **Fieldwork with three sets of respondents**

1. Semi-structured interviews with 40 'elite' policymakers/actors
2. 24 focus groups (6-10 respondents) with frontline welfare practitioners who implement policy
3. Three rounds of repeat qualitative longitudinal interviews with a diverse sample of 400 welfare recipients who are subject to conditionality i.e. 1200 interviews in total.

Fieldwork will be undertaken in a variety of locations in England and Scotland.

# Conclusions: whither social citizenship?

- **Conditionality:** a significant reformulation of the rights and responsibilities of social citizenship
- **A focus on individual behaviour:** marginalises social, economic and political causes of unemployment, poverty and social issues
- **Citizenship in challenging times:** the return of the economic imperative
- **Conditionality offers an appealing mix of the financial and behavioural:** in the age of austerity 'money and morals' (Dwyer 2000) serve as a smokescreen to undermine the welfare state
- **This is not a eulogy to T.H. Marshall:** institutionally situated social rights are essential for effective social citizenship
- **A diminished vision of social citizenship/social justice in the future ?????**